

REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES SUPREME COURT Manila

FEB 2 6 2020

SECOND DIVISION

NOTICE

Sirs/Mesdames:

Please take notice that the Court, Second Division, issued a Resolution dated **22 January 2020** which reads as follows:

"G.R. No. 249218 (Erlinda B. Claro, Elsie B. Avenido, and Alfredo L. Bentulan v. Julieta O. Del Valle, assisted by her husband, Cyril Del Valle). – The Court resolves to GRANT petitioners Erlinda B. Claro, Elsie B. Avenido, and Alfredo L. Bentulan's (petitioners) motion for extension of thirty (30) days from the expiration of the reglementary period within which to file a petition for review on *certiorari*.

After a judicious study of the case, the Court further resolves to **DENY** the instant petition¹ and **AFFIRM** the June 29, 2018 Decision² and the August 29, 2019 Resolution³ of the Court of Appeals (CA) in CA-G.R. SP No. 10494 for failure of petitioners to sufficiently show that the CA committed any reversible error in affirming the rulings of the court *a quo*.

As correctly ruled by the CA, respondent Julieta O. Del Valle is lawfully entitled to ownership and possession of the subject property by virtue of the certificate of title⁴ in her name.⁵ Likewise, the CA correctly held that petitioners failed to substantiate their defense of ownership for lack of sufficient evidence to prove the purported oral contract of sale.⁶ In this regard, case law provides that a certificate of title, as the best proof of ownership of land, prevails over bare and unsubstantiated allegations of ownership, and must be presumed valid in the absence of contrary evidence.⁷ Moreover, it bears stressing that factual findings of the trial courts, when adopted and confirmed by the CA, are binding and

(130)URES

- more -

Rollo, pp. 12-26.

Id. at 68-76. Penned by Associate Justice Edward B. Contreras with Associate Justices Edgardo L. Delos Santos (now a member of this Court) and Louis P. Acosta, concurring.

³ Id. at 40-41. Penned by Associate Justice Edward B. Contreras with Associate Justices Edgardo L. Delos Santos (now a member of this Court) and Emily R. Aliño-Geluz, concurring.

⁴ Not attached to the *rollo*.

See rollo, p. 35.

[°] See id. at 36.

See Spouses Cruz v. Heirs of So Hiong, G.R. No. 228641, November 5, 2018.

Resolution

conclusive on this Court and will generally not be reviewed on appeal, absent any of the exceptions laid down by jurisprudence,⁸ as in this case.

SO ORDERED. (Reyes, A., Jr. and Hernando, JJ., on official leave. Delos Santos; J., no part due to prior action in the CA, Reyes, J., Jr., J., designated Additional Member per Raffle dated January 6, 2020.)"

Very truly yours TERÉSITA UINO TUAZON

Deputy Division Clerk of Court 1 WEB 2020

BENTULAN LAW OFFICES (reg) Counsel for Petitioners Suite 208, Commercial Center Building 1091 N. Lopez St., Ermita Manila

ATTY. MITCHELLE JOHN L. BOISER (reg) Counsel for Respondent 2nd Floor, St. Jude Building Gallares St., Tagbilaran City 6300

HON. PRESIDING JUDGE (reg) Regional Trial Court, Branch 52 Talibon, 6325 Bohol (Civil Case No. 0522) JUDGMENT DIVISION (x) Supreme Court, Manila

PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICE (x) LIBRARY SERVICES (x) [For uploading pursuant to A.M. No. 12-7-SC]

OFFICE OF THE CHIEF ATTORNEY (x) OFFICE OF THE REPORTER (x) Supreme Court, Manila

COURT OF APPEALS (reg) Visayas Station Cebu City CA-G.R. SP No. 10494

Please notify the Court of any change in your address. GR249218. 1/22/2020(130)URES

See Insular Investment and Trust Corporation v. Capital One Equities Corporation, 686 Phil. 819, 830-831 (2012).

(130)**URES**